



 CATALOGUE ENTRY

Old Man with a Tall, Fur-Edged Cap

about 1650

Workshop of Rembrandt van Rijn

Dutch, 1606–1669

oil on oak panel (with additions)

11-5/16 × 9-9/16 in.

(28.7 × 24.3 cm)

The Clowes Collection

2016.164

Marks, Inscriptions, and Distinguishing Features

None

Entry

1 When it was first purchased by Dr. George H.A. Clowes in 1934, this small study was praised as an accomplished work by Rembrandt van Rijn, painted in his later years.¹ Figures of old age had long occupied the artist,² and this bearded man exemplifies his interest in representing the wrinkled skin and gray hair of a life long-lived. The artist applied the paint in the service of this naturalistic representation: the crimson fur-edged hat that sits squarely on the man's head, the weathered flesh, and the downy beard are painted with varying degrees of thickness, while the brownish fur-lined cloak and jerkin are executed so thinly that the ground is visible beneath the paint. This conscious manipulation of the paint reinforces the picture's appeal as a captivating image of old age.

2 The broad application of paint and the earthy tonality associate the panel with Rembrandt's manner of the late 1640s and early 1650s,³ as do three additional works of art historically connected with the artist but long relegated to the status of copies.⁴ The full-length *Old Man in a Red Hat* (fig. 1) shows the model seated and wearing similar garb, though his cloak is of a lighter, yellowish color and he holds a long wooden staff.⁵ Additional slight variations may be found: the jerkin in the Clowes painting features eye-catching buttons, the old man's lips are parted slightly, and his gaze is raised higher than in the Berlin painting. A second related painting, which crops the figure just below his knees, is in the collection of the Kimbell Art Museum, Fort Worth (fig. 2).⁶ The connection between the Clowes painting and this one is weaker, however, as the old man in the latter work shows slightly more torsion, resulting in his expression of surprise or apprehension, though his mouth is open and his gaze high, as in the Clowes painting. An engraving (fig. 3) after the Kimbell version indicates that this work was originally full-length, which aligns it more closely with the Berlin painting.⁷



Figure 1: Rembrandt van Rijn (Dutch, 1606–1669), *Old Man with a Red Cap*, around 1650, oil on canvas, 20-5/8 × 14-9/16 in. Gemäldegalerie, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, Berlin, 8281. © Photo: Gemäldegalerie der Staatlichen Museen zu Berlin - Prussian Cultural Heritage. Photo by Christoph Schmidt.



Figure 2: After Rembrandt van Rijn (?), *An Old Man in an Armchair*, after 1655, oil on panel, 13-11/16 × 11 in., 22 × 19-1/4 × 4-1/4 in. (framed). Kimbell Art Museum, Fort Worth, Texas, ACF 1960.01.



Figure 3: Pierre Louis Surugue (French, 1716–1772), *Le Père de Rembrandt*, 1759, etching and engraving on paper, 10-25/32 × 7-29/32 in. The British Museum, London, 1861,109.278. © The Trustees of the British Museum.

3 The relationship between these three paintings has been the subject of much recent research. In volume six of the *Corpus of Rembrandt Paintings* (2015), Ernst van de Wetering rehabilitates the Berlin painting and gives it to Rembrandt, citing its historic attribution to the master until 1968 and its unrecognized classification as an oil sketch meant to capture the physical activity of movement (here, the activity of rising from a chair).¹⁰ He also cites technical evidence, such as the presence of vermilion in the man's sleeve but not in his red hat, and the support's origins in a larger piece of canvas to argue that this was an informal study made by the master, comparing it to the *Woman Bathing in a Stream* (1654, London, National Gallery, NG54). This leads him to conclude that the Clowes and Kimbell panels are "satellite" variations on this prototype, which he dates to about 1654. Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg and Katja Kleinert, having undertaken an extensive investigation of the painting at the Gemäldegalerie in 2014, arrived at a similar conclusion—that the Berlin painting is by the master's hand—in a report dated to November 2015.¹¹ Laurenze-Landsberg and Kleinert explored the physical condition of the painting and determined that it has undergone significant changes: the saffron-colored glazing of the outer robe is not original, the shape and volume of the red hat has been altered, and the background has been overcleaned and repainted. The red hat, the authors contend, would have much more closely resembled the shape of the headgear in the Clowes panel.¹² In addition, the painting's quartz ground supports an origin in Rembrandt's workshop.¹³ Building upon Van de Wetering's hypothesis that this painting is an oil study, the researchers posit that the Clowes panel preceded the Berlin painting as a character study or *tronie* by an artist in the master's workshop. They date it to the 1640s.¹⁴

4 In spite of the various new data and the close relationships between the three paintings, technical and stylistic evidence indicate that the Clowes panel should remain within the category of Rembrandt's orbit.¹⁵ *Dendrochronological* analysis by Ian Tyers dates an approximate period of use of the oak panel to between 1626 and 1650,¹⁶ which suggests that the painting would have been made in Rembrandt's own lifetime.¹⁷ And while the calcium-carbonate ground and light-brown *imprimatura* above it are consistent with Rembrandt's studio, they do not conclusively prove an origin in the master's workshop.¹⁸ The handling of the paint in the Clowes panel demonstrates an awareness of Rembrandt's efficient treatment of ground and upper paint layers, but it lacks the master's bravura and fullness.

5 In spite of the much-debated relationships between these works and the master, clear ties to his studio are evident. In 1940, W.R. Valentiner proposed that the bust-length painting was "probably used for the composition of the supper at Emaus [sic] in the Louvre...the type of one of the disciples of Christ which appears in this famous picture."¹⁹ The Clowes panel also bears some similarity to Rembrandt's fragmentary *Homer* (fig. 4), dated 1663, through the bearded aged man, his knowing gaze, the slightly parted lips, and the broad handling of paint. The Berlin painting, in which the figure sits upright in his chair as he grasps his walking stick, has been related to a handful of drawings of the 1640s by Rembrandt and his students, including *Joseph Telling His Dreams to Jacob*, about 1642–1643 (Vienna, Albertina); *The Return of the Prodigal Son*, about 1656 (London, Victoria and Albert Museum); and, less convincingly, *An Old Man Seated in an Armchair*, about 1640–1645 (London, British Museum).²⁰ The print after the Kimbell version even refers to the sitter as "Rembrandt's father." Also, the bearded man evokes the focused depictions of older men and women that appear in works dating to Rembrandt's Leiden period.²¹



Figure 4: Rembrandt van Rijn (Dutch, 1606–1669), *Homer*, 1663, oil on canvas, 42-1/8 × 32-9/32 in. Mauritshuis, The Hague, 584.

6 The variety of potential subject matter—from Jacob to the father of the prodigal son, to one of Christ’s disciples to Homer, and even to Rembrandt’s father—raises questions about the identity of the figure in the Clowes painting. The fur-trimmed cloak over the man’s buttoned jerkin and the fur lining of the hat suggest winter attire,²⁰ though the paintings and drawings to which the figure has been related do not specify a winter setting. And while such clothing appears in works by Rembrandt and his students, such as Rembrandt’s 1631 *Simeon’s Song of Praise* (The Hague, Mauritshuis),²¹ costume historian Irene Groeneweg maintains that no substantial assessment of intended ethnic group or historical period can be read into the garments.²² Like Willem Drost’s *Seated Man with a Red Fur-Trimmed Cap* (about 1654, Dresden, Staatliche Kunstsammlungen Gemäldegalerie, inv. 1568) and the paintings in Berlin and Fort Worth, this figure is isolated from a larger narrative context.

7 Whether a “partial copy” inspired by the Berlin painting or, less likely, a character study (*tronie*) that preceded it,²³ the Clowes panel shows an artist trying to emulate Rembrandt’s late “rough” handling. Without further determination of its age, this *tronie* can only be viewed as a charming interpretation of Rembrandt’s late style by a talented follower working in about 1650.

Author

[Jacquelyn N. Coutré](#)

Provenance

Féréol Bonnemaïson (1766–1827), Paris;

Sale at (M. Henry, Paris) in 1827;²⁴

William Williams Hope (1802–1855), Paris, London, and Rushton Hall, Northamptonshire;²⁵

V.H. Crosby, London;

By descent to Mrs. H. Hallahan, London, probably until 1904.²⁶

(Dowdeswell and Dowdeswell, London);²⁷

Baron Leopold Hirsch (1867–1932), London, by 1906;²⁸

Sale at (Christie’s, London) in 1934;²⁹

(John Nicholson, London), in 1934.³⁰

(Ehrich-Newhouse Galleries, New York), in 1934;

G.H.A. Clowes, Indianapolis, in 1934 and until 1944.³¹

(Ivan N. Podgoursky, New York).³²

Private English collection.³³

(Newhouse Galleries, New York), by 1955;

G.H.A. Clowes, Indianapolis, in 1955;³⁴

Clowes Fund Collection, Indianapolis, 1958–present;

On long-term loan to the Indianapolis Museum of Art, Courtesy of The Clowes Fund, since 1971 (CI0062);

Given to the Indianapolis Museum of Art in 2016.

Exhibitions

Grafton Galleries, London, 1909–10, *A Catalogue of the Pictures and Drawings in the National Loan Exhibition in aid of National Gallery Funds held in the Grafton Galleries, London*, no. 41 ;

Ehrich-Newhouse Galleries, New York, 1935, *Catalogue of a Loan Exhibition of Paintings in Aid of The Architects' Emergency Fund*, no. 25;

John Herron Art Museum, Indianapolis, 1937, *Dutch Paintings, Etchings, Drawings, Delftware of the Seventeenth Century*, no. 59;

North Carolina Museum of Art, Raleigh, 1956, *Rembrandt and His Pupils*, no. 24 ;

John Herron Art Museum, Indianapolis, 1959, *Paintings from the Collection of George Henry Alexander Clowes: A Memorial Exhibition*, no. 46;

The Art Gallery, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN, 1962, *A Lenten Exhibition Loaned by the Clowes Fund, Incorporated of Indianapolis*, no. 40.

Indiana University Museum of Art, Bloomington, 1963, *Northern European Painting: The Clowes Fund Collection*, no. 38;

Indianapolis Museum of Art at Newfields, 2019, *Life and Legacy: Portraits from the Clowes Collection*.

References

Catalogue de Tableaux Précieux des diverses écoles et autres objets de curiosité...formant le cabinet de feu M. le Chevalier Féréol Bonnemaison, sale cat., M. Henry, Paris, 20 April 1827, no. 71 ;

Catalogue de tableaux anciens des écoles flamands, hollandaise et françaises provenant de la galerie de M.W. Hope..., sale cat., Pouchet, Paris, 11 May 1858, no. 16 ;

A Catalogue of Pictures, Comprising Oil Paintings, Water-colour Drawings and Engravings..., sale cat., Knight, Frank & Rutley, London, 14 April 1904, lot 78;

Wilhelm von Bode and Cornelis Hofstede de Groot, *The Complete Works of Rembrandt*, trans. Florence Simmonds, vol. 8 (Paris: C. Sedelmeyer, 1906), no. 587 (reproduced);

A Catalogue of the Pictures and Drawings in the National Loan Exhibition in aid of National Gallery Funds held in the Grafton Galleries, London, exh. cat. (London: William Heinemann, 1909), no. 41 (reproduced);

Hans Posse, *Die Gemäldegalerie des Kaiser-Friedrich-Museums: Vollständiger beschreibender Katalog mit Abbildungen sämtlicher Gemälde* (Berlin: Julius Bard, 1911), 2:186, under no. 828 J;

Algernon Graves, *A Century of Loan Exhibitions: 1813–1912* (London: Algernon Graves, 1914), 3: 1018;

J.O. Kronig, *A Catalogue of the Paintings at Doughty House, Richmond, and Elsewhere in the Collection of Sir Frederick Cook BT* (London: William Heinemann, 1914), 2: mentioned under no. 314;

Cornelis Hofstede de Groot, *A Catalogue Raisonné of the Works of the Most Eminent Dutch Painters of the Seventeenth Century, Based on the Work of John Smith*, trans. Edward G. Hawke, vol. 6 (London: Macmillan and Co., 1916), no. 400;

W.R. Valentiner, *The Work of Rembrandt Reproduced in 643 Illustrations*, Classics in Art series, 3rd ed. (New York: Brentano's, 1921), 436 (reproduced);

David S. Meldrum, *Rembrandt's Paintings with an Essay on His Life and Work* (New York: E.P. Dutton and Company, 1923), 179, 199, 354 (reproduced);

Andrew Carfax, "Treasures of the Leopold Hirsch Collections," *The Connoisseur* (March 1934): 183 (reproduced), 184;

Catalogue of the Collection of Important Pictures by Old Masters, British Portraits, Engravings and Drawings, the Property of Leopold Hirsch, Esq., sale cat., Christie, Manson, and Woods, London, 11 May 1934, no. 126 (reproduced);

Edward Alden Jewell, "Emergency Fund Gains by Exhibit," *The New York Times*, 18 January 1935, 21;

Catalogue of a Loan Exhibition of Paintings in Aid of The Architects' Emergency Fund, exh. cat. (New York: Ehrich-Newhouse Galleries, 1935), no. 25;

W.D. Peat, *Dutch Paintings, Etchings, Drawings, Delftware of the Seventeenth Century*, exh. cat. (Indianapolis: John Herron Art Museum, 1937), no. 59;

W.R. Valentiner, *Rembrandt and His Pupils*, exh. cat. (Raleigh: The North Carolina Museum of Art, 1956), no. 24 (reproduced);

David G. Carter, *Paintings from the Collection of George Henry Alexander Clowes: A Memorial Exhibition*, exh. cat. (Indianapolis: John Herron Art Museum, 1959), no. 46 (reproduced);

F.W. Bilodeau, "The Clowes Fund Collection at Indianapolis, Indiana," *The Connoisseur* 148, no. 595 (August 1961): 3–9 (reproduced);

Gemäldegalerie: Verzeichnis der ausgestellten Gemälde des 13. bis 18. Jahrhunderts im Museum Dahlem (Berlin: Staatliche Museen, Stiftung Preussischer Kulturbesitz, 1961), 73, mentioned under no. 828 I;³⁵

John Howett, *A Lenten Exhibition Loaned by the Clowes Fund, Incorporated of Indianapolis*, exh. cat. (Notre Dame, IN: The Art Gallery, University of Notre Dame, 1962), no. 40;

Henry R. Hope, *Northern European Painting: The Clowes Fund Collection*, exh. cat. (Bloomington: Indiana University Museum of Art, 1963), no. 38 (reproduced);

Donald Hoffmann, "Old House Has Master Paintings," *The Kansas City Times*, 14 September 1967, sec. 4B;

Mark Roskill, "Clowes Collection Catalogue" (unpublished typed manuscript, IMA Clowes Archive, Indianapolis Museum of Art, Indianapolis, IN, 1968);

A. Ian Fraser, *A Catalogue of the Clowes Collection* (Indianapolis: Indianapolis Museum of Art, 1973), xxxv–xxxvi, 84–85 (reproduced), as attributed to Rembrandt;

Werner Sumowski, *Gemälde der Rembrandt-Schüler*, vol. 6 (Landau and Pfalz: Edition PVA, 1983), 3527n18, as not by Rembrandt;

Peter C. Sutton, *A Guide to Dutch Art in America* (Washington, DC: The Netherlands—American Amity Trust, Inc., 1986), 120, as possibly not Rembrandt;

Ernst van de Wetering, *A Corpus of Rembrandt Paintings*, vol. 6, *Rembrandt's Paintings Revisited: A Complete Survey* (Dordrecht: Stichting Foundation Rembrandt Research Project, 2015), 622, as from Rembrandt's workshop, mentioned under no. 230;

Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg and Katja Kleinert, "Documentation Summary: Attributed to Rembrandt, Old man with a red cap," Gemäldegalerie Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, <https://rkd.nl/explore/technical/5010370>.

Notes

1. Rembrandt connoisseur Wilhelm von Bode placed the painting between 1656 and 1658 in an undated certificate of authenticity, what must be the earliest certificate issued by a scholar on this painting. Cornelis Hofstede de Groot, in a certificate of authenticity dated April 1929, which G.H.A. Clowes certainly knew when considering the purchase of this painting, attributes the work to Rembrandt without a date. See File CI0062, Clowes Registration Archive, Indianapolis Museum of Art at Newfields.
2. Rembrandt's preference for elderly figures was shared with his peers and students in Leiden and Amsterdam, and certainly contributed to a broader taste for such imagery. In the foreword to his *Paradigmata* of 1670, Jan de Bisschop (1628–1671) specifically cites the use of old figures as an appropriately painterly subject. He argues that art can more "nicely and pleasantly" represent that which is disgraceful in real life, thereby "making it possible for art to prefer a misformed, old wrinkled human over a well-made, fresh and youthful one." ("...t geen in 't leven is afsienlijck, inde konst en uytebeeld sij goet en behagelijck dat meer schilderachtich sij en voor de kunst verkieselijck een mismaect, out verrimpelt mensch, als een welgemaect, fris, en jeudigh.") As quoted in Ernst Van de Wetering, ed., *A Corpus of Rembrandt Paintings*, vol. 4, *Self-Portraits* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2005), 561n32. Recent studies of old age include Anouk Janssen, *Grijsaards in zwart-wit: De verbeelding van de ouderdom in de Nederlandse prentkunst (1550–1650)* (Zutphen: Walburg, 2007), and Lynn A. Botelho, "An idle youth makes a needy old age: The 17th Century," in Pat Thane, ed., *A History of Old Age* (Los Angeles: The J. Paul Getty Museum, 2005).
3. Certificates in the Clowes Registration Archive attest to connoisseurs' belief in the painting's origins in the artist's late period. In keeping with Von Bode's dating mentioned above, William Suida dates the painting to about 1655 in an undated statement. Certificates of 11 October 1940 and 5 June 1951 by Wilhelm Valentiner give the painting to Rembrandt with dates of about 1650 and 1654, respectively.
4. A fourth related work, a drawing (KdZ 24723) after the Clowes panel recently discovered by Katja Kleinert and Holm Bevers in the Kupferstichkabinett in Berlin, is clearly a copy done outside Rembrandt's circle. It remains uncertain if it is seventeenth- or eighteenth-century in origin.
5. On this painting, see Christian Tümpel, *Rembrandt: All the Paintings in Colour* (Antwerp: Fonds Mercator, 1993), no. A48, and Ernst van de Wetering, *A Corpus of Rembrandt Paintings*, vol. 6, *Rembrandt's Paintings Revisited: A Complete Survey* (Dordrecht: Stichting Foundation Rembrandt Research Project, 2015), no. 230.
6. On this painting, see "Einleitung und Schlusswort," in Werner Sumowski, *Gemälde der Rembrandt-Schüler*, vol. 6 (Landau: Edition PVA, 1994), 3518–3519.
7. There are, in turn, differences between the Berlin and Kimbell paintings: the open mouth and sharper turn of the head, the pose of the proper left arm and the position of the end of the staff on the outside of the proper right foot (as indicated in the Surugue print), and the presence of curtains in the background. As Roxy Sperber notes in her technical report, large strips had been added to the Clowes panel in the early twentieth century. These strips added breadth to the man and would have imbued him with a monumentality similar to the Kimbell and Berlin paintings.
8. Ernst van de Wetering, *A Corpus of Rembrandt Paintings*, vol. 6, *Rembrandt's Paintings Revisited: A Complete Survey* (Dordrecht: Stichting Foundation Rembrandt Research Project, 2015), no. 230.
9. See Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg and Katja Kleinert, "Documentation: Rembrandt – Old Man with a Red Cap – Summary – April 2014," dated November 2015, shared with the staff at the Indianapolis Museum of Art at Newfields.
10. Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg and Katja Kleinert, "Documentation: Rembrandt – Old Man with a Red Cap – Summary – April 2014," 3–4.
11. The presence of quartz was noted by Hermann Kühn in the 1960s; see Hermann Kühn, "Untersuchungen zu den Malgründen Rembrandts," *Jahrbuch der Staatlichen Kunstsammlungen von Baden-Württemberg 2* (1965): 198, as reported in Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg and Katja Kleinert, "Documentation: Rembrandt – Old Man with a Red Cap – Summary – April 2014," 2.
12. Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg and Katja Kleinert, "Documentation: Rembrandt – Old Man with a Red Cap – Summary – April 2014," 12.
13. An oral communication from Seymour Slive to Mark Roskill in 1967 identified the Clowes painting as a school piece; see Mark Roskill, "Clowes Collection Catalogue" (unpublished typed manuscript, IMA Clowes Archive, Indianapolis Museum of Art, Indianapolis, IN, 1968). Subsequent authors have followed suit in declaring the work to be by a student or member of Rembrandt's circle.
14. Ian Tyers, "Ian Tyers, "Tree-Ring Analysis and Wood Identification of Paintings from the Indianapolis Museum of Art: Dendrochronological Consultancy Report 1082," January 2019, p. 20, Conservation Department files, Indianapolis Museum of Art at Newfields.
15. The size of the panel accords with a known standard panel size, 10 × 8 Amsterdam "duim" (inches), that Rembrandt seems to have used in about 1640. See Arie Wallert and Michel van der Laar, "Rembrandt's *Head of Christ*: Some Technical Observations concerning Matters of Style," in Stephanie S. Dickey, ed., *Rembrandt and His Circle: Insights and Discoveries* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2017), 217.
16. See [Technical Examination Report](#) and Ashok Roy, "Rembrandt's Materials and Technique: The Ground Layer, Function and Type," in David Bomford et al., *Art in the Making: Rembrandt* (London: National Gallery, 2006), 27.
17. Valentiner also thought the painting "a fine characteristic study by Rembrandt." See his certificate of authenticity, dated 11 October 1940, in Clowes Registration Archive, Indianapolis Museum of Art at Newfields.
18. For these drawings, see Otto Benesch, *A Catalogue of Rembrandt's Selected Drawings* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1947), nos. 526, 1011, and 528, respectively.
19. See, for example, his *Anna and Tobit*, 1626 (Amsterdam, Rijksmuseum); his *Apostle Paul in Prison*, 1627 (Stuttgart, Staatsgalerie); and his *Head of an Old Man*, about 1629 (Kingston, ON, Queen's University, Agnes Etherington Art Centre).
20. Compare, for instance, the beard and garb worn by the figure in Hendrick Bloemaert's *Allegory of Winter*, 1631 (formerly Amsterdam, Rijksmuseum; destroyed in 1940). See also Rembrandt's portrait of *Nicolaes Ruts*, 1631 (New York, The Frick Collection), which prominently features fur because of the model's sitting for the artist in the winter or, more likely, his participation in the fur trade. While the outer garment may bear some resemblance to an article of clothing known as a *tabbaard*, Irene Groeneweg cautioned against the use of the term, which always describes a full-length item; Irene Groeneweg, email message to author, 30 January 2014. On the *tabbaard*, see Marieke De Winkel, *Fashion and Fancy: Dress and Meaning in Rembrandt's Paintings* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2006), 27–50.
21. Such high, fur-lined hats also appear in Cornelis de Bisschop's *Scholar in his Study*, about 1655 (Kingston, ON, Queen's University, Agnes Etherington Art Centre), and Heyman Dullaert's *Young Scholar in His Study*, about 1660–1665 (Kingston, ON, Queen's University, Agnes Etherington Art Centre).
22. Irene Groeneweg, email message to author, 29 January 2014. Groeneweg connects the high hat with an illustration of "a merchant from the Netherlands" in Cesare Vecellio's 1590 *De gli habiti antichi et moderni di diverse parti del mondo libri due... (Of Ancient and Modern Dress of Diverse Parts of the World in Two Books...)*, which, in turn, is based on an earlier illustration of a Muscovite or Russian merchant in Jost Amman's 1577 *Trachtenbuch*. Groeneweg postulates that such costume compendia could have informed the painter of the Clowes panel's understanding of an "Eastern," or Old Testament, figure, which is confirmed by the three drawings mentioned above.
23. On the "partial copy," see Michel Franken, "Learning by Imitation: Copying Paintings in Rembrandt's Workshop," in Ernst van de Wetering et al., *Rembrandt: Quest of a Genius*, exh. cat. (Zwolle: Waanders, 2006), 153–177, 169, especially. For recent literature on the *tronie*, see Jaap Van der Veen, "Faces from Life: *Tronies* and Portraits in Rembrandt's Painted Oeuvre," in Albert Blankert et al., *Rembrandt: A Genius and His Impact*, exh. cat. (Zwolle: Waanders, 1997), 69–80; Dagmar Hirschfelder, *Tronie und Porträt in der niederländischen Malerei des 17. Jahrhunderts* (Berlin: Gebr. Mann Verlag, 2008); and Franziska Gottwald, *Das Tronie: Muster, Studie, Meisterwerk; Die Genese einer Gattung der Malerei vom 15. Jahrhundert bis zu Rembrandt* (Munich and Berlin: Deutscher Kunstverlag, 2011).

24. *Catalogue de Tableaux Précieux des diverses écoles et autres objets de curiosité...formant le cabinet de feu M. le Chevalier Féréol Bonnemaison*, sale cat., M. Henry, Paris, 20 April 1827, no. 71. The description of this lot, cut from a copy of the auction catalogue, is attached to the back of the painting.
25. *Catalogue de tableaux anciens des écoles flamands, hollandaise et françaises provenant de la galerie de M.W. Hope...*, sale cat., Pouchet, Paris, 11 May 1858, no. 16.
26. According to the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston's website, for a painting by Benjamin West (06.2362), the Hallahan estate sale took place on 14 April 1904 in London at Knight, Frank & Rutley, "being part of the collection formed by the late V.H. Crosby."
27. This is recorded in Wilhelm Von Bode and Cornelis Hofstede de Groot, *The Complete Works of Rembrandt*, trans. Florence Simmonds, vol. 8 (Paris: C. Sedelmeyer, 1906), no. 587(reproduced); a Dowdeswell and Dowdeswell label appears on the back of the panel.
28. As recorded in Wilhelm Von Bode and Cornelis Hofstede de Groot, *The Complete Works of Rembrandt*, trans. Florence Simmonds, vol. 8 (Paris: C. Sedelmeyer, 1906), no. 587 (reproduced), and see *A Catalogue of the Pictures and Drawings in the National Loan Exhibition in aid of National Gallery Funds held in the Grafton Galleries* (London: William Heinemann, 1909), no. 41, as loaned by Hirsch.
29. *Catalogue of the Collection of Important Pictures by Old Masters, British Portraits, Engravings and Drawings: The Property of Leopold Hirsch, Esq., deceased*, sale cat., Christie, Manson and Woods, London, 11 May 1934, no. 126 (reproduced).
30. Although an annotated copy of the *Catalogue of the Collection of Important Pictures by Old Masters, British Portraits, Engravings and Drawings: The Property of Leopold Hirsch, Esq., deceased* at the Frick Art Reference Library (FARL) indicates the painting sold to "G. Nicholson," an article listing Hirsch auction results indicates that lot no. 126 went to John Nicholson, the English dealer; see "Highest Prices in Hirsch Dispersals," in *The Art News* (1934): 17.
31. See invoice, 31 May 1934, signed by Bertram Newhouse and G.H.A. Clowes, File CI0062, Clowes Registration Archive, Indianapolis Museum of Art at Newfields.
32. In correspondence with Podgoursky in spring 1944, "the little Rembrandt panel" was one of several paintings G.H.A. Clowes agreed to sell; see Podgoursky Correspondence File, Clowes Registration Archive, Indianapolis Museum of Art at Newfields. On occasion, G.H.A. Clowes sought to upgrade his collection by exchange or by trade, or when seeking funds to purchase another painting.
33. The particular private English collection is not identified by Newhouse Galleries at the time of its sale to G.H.A. Clowes for a second time. See File CI0062, Clowes Registration Archive, Indianapolis Museum of Art at Newfields.
34. The painting is included in the exhibition and its catalogue, *Paintings from the Collection of George Henry Alexander Clowes: A Memorial Exhibition*, exh. cat. (Indianapolis: John Herron Art Museum, 1959), no. 46 (reproduced).
35. The painting is similarly described in the editions of the catalogue published in 1962, 1963, 1964, and 1966.